

Summary Sheet

Cabinet Report

Title: All Saints Toilets – revised options (ASR EDS 11)

Is this a Key Decision and has it been included on the Forward Plan?

No

Strategic Director Approving Submission of the Report

Ian Thomas, Strategic Director CYPS

Report Author(s)

Kim Phillips - Catering & Facilities Services Manager, Education & Skills

Ward(s) Affected

All

Summary

The All Service Review (ASR) detailed a proposal to change the access arrangements to the All Saints Square, Public Toilets and making them an unattended facility. The facility is used by members of the public within the central town area.

The proposed ASR saving is £6,000, with an agreed capital expenditure for alternations of £10,000. This budget was an approximate figure provided by Asset Management prior to a detailed analysis of need.

A full surveyor's investigation and appraisal is now completed. An indicative cost for a full height double gated turnstile similar to football stadium access has a capital estimate of up to £14,000 which is inclusive of service connections, installation and project fees.

Considering the escalating capital funding required and the unlikelihood of pay-back during the required period for spend-to-save an alternative proposal is made for 2016/17.

The proposals are to increase the entrance fee to 30p, which has the potential to increase income by £3,500 based on existing customer usage. There will also be a reduction in current opening hours (09:00 to 17:00) making a further saving of £4,500. This will result in the facility been closed at low usage times between 09:00 and 10:00 and 16:00 and 17:00.

There will also be a public consultation into the provision of this facility to determine its long-term viability. The consultation will take place during September 2016 with a report regarding further options by November 2016.

Recommendations

It is recommended that:

- a) There is an increase to the entrance charge of 10p (raising the cost up to 30p) and a reduction in the opening hours to 10:00-16:00 from 09:00-17:00.
- b) There will also be a public consultation into the provision of this facility to determine its long-term viability. The consultation will take place during September 2016 with a report regarding further options by November 2016 being brought to members.

List of Appendices Included

None

Background Papers

ASR (EDS 11)

Consideration by any other Council Committee, Scrutiny or Advisory Panel

No

Council Approval Required

Yes

Exempt from the Press and Public

No

Main report: All Saints Toilets – revised options (ASR)

1. Recommendations

1.1 It is recommended that:

- a) There is an increase to the entrance charge of 10p (raising the cost up to 30p) and a reduction in the opening hours to 10:00-16:00 from 09:00-17:00.
- b) There will also be a public consultation into the provision of this facility to determine its long-term viability. The consultation will take place during September 2016 with a report regarding further options by November 2016 being brought to members.

2. Background

- 2.1 The All Service Review (ASR)(EDS 11) detailed a proposal to change the access arrangements to the All Saints Square, Public Toilets and making them an unattended facility. The facility is used by members of the public within the central town area. There is a separate external disabled facility which is accessed by a RADAR key.
- 2.2 The ASR saving is £6,000, with an agreed capital expenditure of £10,000 to achieve the alterations. This budget was an approximate figure provided by Asset Management prior to a detailed analysis of need.
- 2.3 A full surveyor's investigation and appraisal is now completed. An indicative cost for a full height double gated turnstile similar to football stadium access has a capital estimate of up to £14,000 which is inclusive of service connections, installation and project fees.
- 2.4 This option does not allow accompanied/assisted adult access to the toilets or access for wheelchairs or some child carriers due to insufficient space to accommodate a gated barrier alongside the turnstile.
- 2.5 Consideration of Low level doors being installed in lieu of turnstiles raised issues of misuse by members of the public climbing over the barrier.
- 2.6 Considering the escalating capital funding required and the unlikelihood of pay-back during the required period for spend-to-save an alternative proposal is offered for 2016/17. The turnstile will no longer be a considered option.
- 2.7 The proposals are to increase the entrance fee to 30p, which has the potential to increase income by £3,500 based on existing customer usage. There will also be a reduction in opening hours making a further saving of £4,500. This will result in the facility being closed at low usage times between 09:00 and 10:00 and 16:00 and 17:00, (from current opening times of 09:00 to 17:00).

3. Key Issues

- 3.1 The ASR (EDS 11) proposal has been assessed by technical colleagues and the original capital cost has escalated giving a high probability that the spend-to-save proposal will not achieve a timely payback within the agreed timeline.
- 3.2 The proposed turnstile options does not allow accompanied/assisted adult access to the toilets or access for wheelchairs or some child carriers due to insufficient space to accommodate a gated barrier alongside the turnstile. This option is no-longer viable for these reasons.
- 3.3 Consultation with Town Centre businesses has raised significant concerns with an unattended facility attracting anti-social behaviour.
- 3.4 A further review of usage has identified the opportunity to reduce opening hours at the start and end of the working day which gives a cost effective savings option of £4,500.
- 3.5 An increase in entrance fee to 30p, will give a potential increase in income of £3,500 based on existing customer levels.

4. Options considered and recommended proposal

- 4.1 Given the budget pressure, a proposal to close the facility was made as a long-term solution. However this would require a full-scale public consultation alongside investigating alternative funding options.
- 4.2 The recommendation is:
 - a) Increase the entrance charge by 10p (raising the cost up to 30p) and reduce the open hours to 10:00-16:00 (from 09:00 to 17:00).
 - b) There will also be a public consultation into the provision of this facility to determine its long-term viability. The consultation will take place during September 2016 with a report regarding further options by November 2016 for member consideration.

5. Consultation

- 5.1 An Equality Impact Assessment identified the need to consult with Town Centre businesses. The outcome of this process identified significant concerns with an unattended facility in the Town Centre creating an anti-social behaviour issue.
- 5.2 Evaluation of use and consultation with operatives within the facilities has offered changing patterns of usage giving rise to the potential to reduce the opening hours at the start and end of the day.
- 5.3 Previous evaluation of usage patterns offered limited options for savings through reductions in opening times (i.e. between 10:30 and 11:15 and 14:00 and 15:00).

- 5.4 Local and national pressure groups have expressed concerns regarding the closure of public toilets by Local Authorities. In particular in relation to members of the public suffering from medical condition which require more frequent access to toilet facilities.

6. Timetable and Accountability for Implementing this Decision

- 6.1 To achieve the saving this proposal requires immediate implementation.

7. Financial and Procurement Implications

- 7.1 Due to the escalating capital funding required the ASR (EDS 11) is unlikely to achieve pay-back during the required period for spend-to-save.
- 7.2 An alternative proposal to achieve the saving and reduce the budget pressure is proposed below:-

Proposal generation	Saving/Income
Reduce the opening hour by 12 hours per week (10:00 to 16:00)	£4,500
Increase entrance fee to 30p	£3,500 (based on existing customer)
Overall position	£8,000

The unit will continue to present a budget pressure of £13,000.

8. Legal Implications

- 8.1 There are no issues which require legal consideration.

9. Human Resources Implications

- 9.1 Twelve working hours will be lost by the reduction in the opening hours of this facility. It is anticipated that the effected employees will be re-deployed on a voluntary basis.

10. Implications for Children and Young People and Vulnerable Adults

- 10.1 By having a staffed facility there is an effective safeguarding measure in place for children and young adults to access the resource safely.

11 Equalities and Human Rights Implications

- 11.1 It is imperative that any subsequent changes to staff jobs and status are handled according to employment legislation and the policy of the council.

11.2 An Equalities Impact Assessment has been undertaken for the original proposal which identified access restrictions for wheel chairs and some child carriers.

12. Implications for Partners and Other Directorates

12.1 Consultation with Town Centre business as part of the original proposal identified concerns regarding the facility being unmanned and the potential for anti-social behaviour.

13. Risks and Mitigation

13.1 Consideration has been given to the new findings following the surveyors Investigation which posed the following risks:

- Equalities access claims
- Escalating capital expenditure
- Vandalism costs due to unmanned facilities
- Council reputation issues if the unmanned facilities results in anti-social behaviour issues.

14. Accountable Officer(s)

Approvals Obtained from:-

Strategic Director of Finance and Corporate Services:- P Bratley

Director of Legal Services:- S Fletcher

Head of Procurement (if appropriate):- Not applicable

This report is published on the Council's website or can be found at:-

<http://moderngov.rotherham.gov.uk/ieDocHome.aspx?Categories=>.